

MINUTES

Historic Preservation Commission
7447 E. Indian School Road
First Floor Community Development Conference Room
June 12, 2003
5:00 P.M.

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 P.M.

ATTENDANCE

Present: Cathy Johnson, Chairperson
Nancy Dallett
B.J. Gonzales
Doug Sydnor
Janet Wilson
Ed Wimmer

Absent: Tom Lennon

Staff: Don Meserve
Debbie Abele, HPO
Kira Wauwie

Also Present: Janie Ellis

INTRODUCTIONS AND ROLL CALL

A formal roll call confirmed members present as stated above.

MINUTES

Chairperson Johnson requested a correction to the May 8th minutes. On page 3, last sentence that reads: Staff noted that another event was taking place at the same time that some people told staff they would be attending. She requested it be changed to read: Staff noted that another event was taking place at the same time that some *community members* told staff they would be attending.

Chairperson Johnson stated that the minutes of May 8, 2003 stood approved as amended.
Commissioner Sydnor stated he would abstain from participating in the discussion or approval of the May 22, 2003 minutes.

Ms. Abele requested a correction to the May 22, 2003 minutes. On page 3 under the amended motion second bullet point that reads: The ramada design be resubmitted and brought back as a separate application. Should be changed to read: *The ramada design is resubmitted.*

Chairperson Johnson requested several corrections to the May 22, 2003 minutes. On Page 1 under Visitors Jimmy Eriksson should be spelled *Eriksson*.

On page 2, sixth paragraph, last sentence that reads: Mr. Sydnor stated the shed was built after the building. Should be changed to read: *Mr. Sydnor stated the shed was built after the original building.*

On page 4, second paragraph under Regular Business, that reads: Mr. Meserve stated they did not know there was a special reception event occurring at the same time as the open house regarding the Mayor Drinkwater statue reception. Should be changed to read: *Mr. Meserve stated they did not have the turnout they wanted in part because of the special reception for the Mayor Drinkwater statue that was occurring at the same time as the open house.*

On page 4, last paragraph, that reads: Chairperson Johnson stated she would be meeting with commission members from Tempe and Mesa to discuss archeology issues. Should be changed to read: *Chairperson Johnson stated that the three Commissions Scottsdale, Tempe, and Mesa would be meeting jointly to discuss preservation issues.*

Chairperson Johnson stated that the minutes of May 22, 2003 stood approved as amended.

REGULAR AGENDA

Committee Reports

Historic Register Committee meeting June 18, 2003

Commissioner Gonzales, Committee co-chair, stated the next Historic Register Committee meeting is scheduled for June 18, 2003. He further stated that several members have indicated they would not be able to attend. Ms. Abele reported several of the committee members have not completed the evaluation sheets and integrity ratings for each of the subdivisions. Commissioner Gonzales stated that although several of the committee members had not completed the evaluation sheets it would still be beneficial to hold the June 18th meeting to get feedback and answer any questions. Commissioner Wimmer, Committee co-chair, stated he would concur with Commissioner Gonzales. He further stated it would be beneficial to set a July deadline to have the evaluation sheets finished.

Education Outreach Committee

Ms. Wilson stated that the Historic Preservation website was posted on the City web pages in May 2003. She further stated that the Committee would prepare a quarterly newsletter. They anticipate an issue to go out in August.

WORK SESSION ITEM

35-ZN-1995#4 Specific Site Development Plan for The Canal at Cattle Track. The current site plan application was submitted by the applicant for Planning Commission and City Council public hearings to fulfill a requirement of the initial SC HP zoning, Case 35-ZN-1995#3 and Ordinance #2894, adopted July 2, 1996 by City Council. The Commission will use the design guidelines from the approved Historic Preservation Plan for this property to discuss the proposed site plan. The property is located at 6105 N. Miller Road (Cattle Track) and is zoned SC HP – Special

Campus/Historic Property. City Council approved Resolution #5776 on May 1, 2001 to maintain the HP zoning for three existing locations, including the Cattle Track Complex.

Ms. Abele provided an overview of case 35-ZN-1995#4. She provided background information on this request. She reported the Commission is here tonight to comment on this plan, which is not specifically under their authority. The Commission will not be voting on the plan but may make comments on the application. She noted the Commission does have the opportunity to forward a recommendation to the Planning Commission and the City Council about the plan as it relates to the design guidelines for this historic property.

Ms. Ellis, owner/applicant, provided additional background information on this plan. She discussed the phasing elements of the project. She provided an overview of the site plan. She noted any new buildings close to the historic buildings would be a very similar style and feel. She further noted the parking lot, for the recently completed phase of construction, has decomposed granite and no asphalt was used. She commented they are hoping they would not have to move any of the existing mature trees. They are also planning on bringing in additional native trees.

Chairperson Johnson requested information on the building materials. Ms. Ellis stated they try to use recycled materials. She further stated they were able to salvage a lot of materials from a house in the neighborhood her father George Ellis built before it was bulldozed.

Commissioner Sydnor requested additional information on the loop road. Ms. Ellis discussed the circulation for the loop road and the residential road and driveway.

Commissioner Wilson inquired if the units along the canal would be two-story units. Ms. Ellis replied in the affirmative. Ms. Wauwie discussed the elevation changes on the canal bank.

Commissioner Gonzales noted on the plan it looks like people would have access from the canal bank but in actuality there is an above ground waterline that runs all the way back there. Ms. Ellis stated it is a waterline that has not been used in years and it is about three feet in diameter and it runs above ground. She further stated it has served as a natural barrier to keep people from walking in so they will leave it until the time comes to development adjacent to the canal.

Commissioner Sydnor stated it would be helpful to see a drawing that showed the proposed versus the existing.

Ms. Ellis stated she would be happy to receive the Commission's stamp of approval for this plan.

Ms. Abele summarized the specific design guidelines that the Commission should consider in their discussion on the plan.

Following their discussion the Commission directed staff to prepare a letter stating that the Historic Preservation Commission has reviewed the plan and found it to be in conformance with the adopted design guidelines.

Commissioner Wilson requested information on the curb, gutters, sidewalks, and lighting for this plan. Ms. Ellis stated there is a stipulation in the zoning case that stated there would be no curbs, gutters, or sidewalks on Cattle Track to maintain the existing rural character of the street. She further stated there would be very low level lighting in the parking lot.

REGULAR AGENDA CONTINUED

HPO/ Staff Report and Announcements

Ms. Abele reported there is a group of people within the city staff working on neighborhood revitalization and trying to support reinvestment. They are looking at potential historic districts. She further reported Molly Edwards is currently compiling a notebook that will contain a series of written guidelines to assist homeowners. She remarked Preservation has agreed to prepare a section of the notebook because it is the same information they will need to prepare for the design guidelines for neighborhoods that are designated as historic districts in the future. Ms. Abele stated it has been her experience with neighbors that it is nice to have something to show them. She further stated this document could be used as an educational tool. She commented they would bring it back to the Commission for a formal review of the section prepared by Preservation.

Commissioner Wimmer stated, after looking at some of the neighborhoods, it seems a lot of people chose to live in these older neighborhoods because they do not want a homeowners association and they do not want rules. He further stated some of the neighbors have exercised their individuality and done it in a manner that does not look junky, but those improvements might not be following the historic character. He remarked the Commission needs to define what in Scottsdale is historic. There is the issue of what should be declared historic compared to what the reality is in Scottsdale. Ms. Abele stated there is a nationwide discussion on ranch houses and production housing. They need to determine what alterations can be allowed or are appropriate that do not compromise the integrity of the historic home.

Commissioner Gonzales stated he has observed through his work in real estate that a lot of the improvements that are being made by homeowners are to make the house more efficient rather than physical improvements.

Mr. Meserve stated the Statewide Historic Preservation Partnership Conference on A Sense of Place will be held on June 26th-28 2003 at the Historic San Marcos Hotel in Chandler, Arizona. He noted that the City submitted a Historic Preservation Fund Pass-Through Application that we are eligible to apply for as a Certified Local Government (CLG) and that a grant was approved to assist with the registration costs for those Commissioners that expressed interest in attending.

Mr. Meserve passed out the latest Summary of City of Scottsdale Archaeology Activities for the Commission to review. The summary will be used by Chairperson Cathy Johnson as a handout at a session on archaeology at the conference. He also passed out a map of the residential districts for the Phoenix Historical Property Register including the ten districts added this past year.

Mr. Meserve provided an update on the status of the parking facilities that are proposed for the downtown area in response to a request from the Chairperson for a report.

Mr. Meserve reported that the Noriega houses on 2nd Street, west of Brown Avenue, are scheduled for demolition. He further reported the family was allowed to go into the homes after the City acquired the property and remove any items they wanted to keep.

Chairperson Johnson inquired if the houses have been well documented. Mr. Meserve stated he has taken some photos of the buildings. A discussion ensued regarding the importance of these houses being well documented and all the information written in a report. It was noted that all four sides of the building should be photographed. How the buildings are oriented should also be documented.

Commissioner Wilson stated a recommendation was made that part of one of the walls be retained. Mr. Meserve stated it is part of the City's plan to do some type of memorial. The Commission instructed Mr. Meserve to take additional pictures of the buildings. Mr. Meserve stated he would take additional pictures tomorrow to document the buildings.

Commissioner Wimmer stated regarding the proposed parking garage on 2nd Street and Brown, there are two historic properties on the east side of Brown Avenue. He inquired if the Commission should go on record indicating that they felt the streetscape needs to be sensitive to the historic properties on Brown Avenue. Chairperson Johnson stated she would write a letter expressing the Commission's views and run it by staff.

Mr. Meserve reported that the proposed changes to the Downtown Overlay were approved by the Planning Commission and will now be reviewed in a public hearing by City Council. Ms. Abele stated, as a result of these proposed downtown ordinance amendments, the Hotel Valley Ho residential component will not require a rezoning.

Ms. Abele reminded the Commission the National Trust Historic Preservation Conference will be held in Denver on September 30th through October 5th. She noted there are not funds available to send the commissioners but if they were interested, she could provide them with a copy of the agenda. Ms. Abele provided a brief update on the status of the OLP Mission Church.

SUMMER MEETING SCHEDULE AND AGENDA ITEMS

Chairperson Johnson stated the next regular Commission meeting is September 11, 2003. It was determined the Commission would not meeting in July and would hold a training session on August 28th. Chairperson Johnson stated at the September meeting the Commission could discuss properties in the downtown i.e. The Pink Pony and the Sugar Bowl.

Commissioner Wilson reported the Education Outreach Committee would meet on September 10th.

Meeting adjourned at 6:45 p.m.

Submitted by:

For the Record Court Reporters